

MC/14/1330

Date Received: 14 May, 2014

Location: Pear Tree Cottage, Noke Street, Wainscott, Rochester, ME3 8BJ

Proposal: Construction of a single storey front extension including integral garage and porch

Applicant: Mr C Milner

Agent:

Ward Strood Rural

Recommendation of Officers to the Planning Committee, to be considered and determined by the Planning Committee at a meeting to be held on 16 July, 2014.

Recommendation - Refusal

- 1 The proposed development by virtue of its size, scale and siting to the front of the property, together with the increase in floorspace proposed, would appear unduly prominent when viewed from the surrounding area and will have an adverse impact on the character of the countryside. Moreover the proposed garage extension would be at odds with the simple design of the original bungalow, projecting at right angles to that structure detract from the character and appearance of the dwelling and the surrounding countryside in general contrary to Policies BNE1 and BNE25 of the Medway Local Plan 2003.

Proposal

This application is for the construction of a single storey front extension including integral garage and porch.

The porch element of the proposal will measure approximately 2.5m wide by 1.5m in depth and with a height of some 3.3m, at its highest point, where it ties in to the roof of the main dwelling.

The proposed integral garage will measure approximately 5.5m in depth by 6m in width as it projects at a right angle from the front of the property. The garage will be some 5m in height to ridge height and will be of a hipped roof design.

A new window is proposed in the south-west facing elevation to serve an existing bedroom (marked on the submitted plans as bedroom 3).

Relevant Planning History

MC/14/0449	Construction of a single storey front extension including integral garage and porch (removal of existing planter) Refusal 10 April, 2014
MC/13/1053	Construction of a double garage and porch to front (removal of existing planter) Refusal Decided 29 July, 2013
MC/11/2774	Application for non-material amendment to planning permission MC/11/0257 for the construction of a single storey side extension (demolition of existing garage) resubmission of MC/10/1542 to reduce the height of the proposed kitchen extension to north east elevation by raising cill Approval With Conditions 28 November, 2011
MC/11/0257	Construction of a single storey side extension (demolition of existing garage) resubmission of MC/10/1542 Refusal 17 March, 2011 Appeal Allowed 22 June 2011
89/0985	Conversion of redundant farm building to residential and erection of a detached garage. Approval with Conditions 18 February, 1991

Representations

The application has been advertised on site and by individual neighbour notification to the owners and occupiers of neighbouring properties.

No objections have been received, however 3 letters of support have been received from neighbouring properties.

Development Plan

The Development Plan for the area comprises the Medway Local Plan 2003. The policies referred to within this document and used in the processing of this application have been assessed against the National Planning Policy Framework, 2012 and are considered to conform.

Planning Appraisal

Background

The bungalow was extended following the grant of permission on appeal in 2011 which stated in paragraph 6 of the appeal decision that the size and bulk of the extension would be partially off-set by the demolition of the garage.

An application for a porch and double garage to the front of the property was received in 2013 (MC/13/1053) which was refused on 29 July 2013 for the following reason:

- *The development by virtue of its height and depth would be excessive in relation to the host property and combined with the existing extension would result in the floor area of the original property increasing by 120% and as such the development is contrary to Policies BNE1 & BNE25 of the Medway Local Plan 2003.*

An appeal against this decision was dismissed on 28 October 2013 for the following summarised reasons:

- *The garage would be prominently located forward of the existing front building line of Pear Tree Cottage. This, combined with its roof height and overall size, would render the garage prominent in the landscape. Furthermore, it would be at odds with the simple design of the original bungalow, projecting at right angles to that structure.*
- *The development as proposed would have an adverse effect upon the character and appearance of the surrounding countryside and that of the host dwelling, contrary to "saved" Policies BNE1 (i) and (ii) and BNE25 (i) and (vi) of the Local Plan.*

The Planning Inspector who determined that appeal made reference to the previous appeal decision in 2011 (ref: APP/A2280/D/11/2151866 dated 22 June 2011), stating that *'paragraph 6 refers to the fact that the size and bulk of the extension would be partially off-set by the demolition of the garage'*. This proposal seeks to replace the earlier garage together with the addition of a porch and the granting of the current submission would render the reason for allowing the appeal in 2011 obsolete.

A further application was received in 2014 (MC/14/0449) for the 'Construction of a single storey front extension including integral garage and porch (removal of existing planter)', and was refused for the following reason;

1. *The proposed development by virtue of its size, scale and siting to the front of the property, together with the increase in floorspace proposed, would appear unduly prominent when viewed from the surrounding area and will have an adverse impact on the character of the countryside. Moreover the proposed garage extension would be at odds with the simple design of the original bungalow, projecting at right angles to that structure detract from contrary to Policies BNE1 and BNE25 of the Medway Local Plan 2003.*

MC/14/0449 is an almost identical scheme to the current application, with the only difference being that the existing planter being retained.

Main Issues

This application falls to be assessed against the Government's National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and the Council's adopted Local Plan. The relevant policy considerations in this instance are: the impact of the development on the character and appearance of the surrounding countryside; design considerations; and impact of the development on neighbouring amenities.

Principle

The application site is outside of Wainscott village boundary, within the open countryside where development is generally restricted unless it falls within particular categories specified in the relevant National Policy Guidance and Development Plan policies. Policy BNE25 of the Medway Local Plan 2003 allows for an extension to a dwelling in the Countryside provided the extension is modest in relation to the original dwelling. The preceding paragraphs to the policy suggest a nominal figure of 25% as representing a modest addition, although it recognises that each case should be considered on its own merits, bearing in mind the material planning considerations.

The proposed front extensions in addition to the existing side extension represent an increase in the floorspace of the existing 'original dwelling' by approximately 106%. When assessing the proposal against the Supplementary Guidance Note to BNE25, the development would not appear to be in reasonable proportion to the original building or other buildings in the vicinity, nor would it nestle into the landscape. Due to the positioning of the proposed garage, which would be at a right angle to the host dwelling, the proposal would be more visible from the road and surrounding footpaths than the original dwelling. The development would neither enhance the character or appearance of the dwelling or the surrounding countryside in general. As such, the development would not accord with Policies BNE1 or BNE25 of the Local Plan 2003 or the Supplementary Guidance Note to that policy.

Design

The front porch on its own is of a modest design and would compliment the host dwelling. However, the garage would be positioned at the front of the property and would project some 6m from the front of the property. This element of the development would be prominent in the landscape and out of keeping with the simple design of the original bungalow and as such is not be considered to be acceptable.

The development and the recently constructed single storey side extension, granted permission in 2011, would increase the floorspace of the 'original' dwelling by more than 106%. This does not represent a modest increase in the size over and above the original dwelling and would have an adverse effect upon the host dwelling and the character and appearance of the surrounding countryside in general contrary to

Policies BNE1 and BNE25 of the Medway Local Plan 2003.

Amenity

In terms of the impact of the development on residential amenity, the proposal by way of the detached nature of the property together with the type and design of the proposals does not significantly impinge upon the daylight, sunlight, outlook or privacy of any neighbouring properties. The development is therefore considered to be acceptable in terms of its impact on the amenities of adjoining residential occupiers in accordance with Policy BNE2 of the Medway Local Plan 2003.

Conclusions and Reasons for Refusal

The proposed development by virtue of its size, scale and siting to the front of the property, together with the increase in floorspace proposed, would result in an unduly prominent form of development when viewed from the surrounding area and would have an adverse impact on the character and appearance of the surrounding countryside contrary to Policies BNE1 and BNE25 of the Medway Local Plan 2003.

The application would normally fall to be determined under delegated powers but has been referred to Committee due to the number of representations received contrary to the recommendation and at the request from Councillor Hicks due to his view that Members need to balance the policy considerations against the small scale nature of the proposal.

Background Papers

The relevant background papers relating to the individual applications comprise: the applications and all supporting documentation submitted therewith; and items identified in any Relevant History and Representations section within the report.

Any information referred to is available for inspection in the Planning Offices of Medway Council at Gun Wharf, Dock Road, Chatham ME4 4TR and here <http://planning.medway.gov.uk/donline/AcolNetCGI.gov>